April 19, 2011

Mr. Stuart Wason  
Chair, Joint Valuation Working Group  
International Association of Insurance Supervisors  
Basel, Switzerland  

Dear Sir

Re: IAA comments on draft ICP 14 Valuation

In response to the request for comments on the February 18, 2011 IAIS draft ICP 14 Valuation, I am pleased to transmit on behalf of the International Actuarial Association (IAA) our comments and recommendations.

These comments have been prepared by the Insurance Regulation Committee of the IAA in cooperation with the Committee on Insurance Accounting. If, upon reading these comments, you identify any points that you wish to pursue, please do not hesitate to contact the chairperson of the Insurance Regulation Committee, Toshihiro Kawano, care of the IAA Secretariat. The IAA will be pleased to develop these ideas further with you.

Yours sincerely

Jean-Louis Massé  
Secretary General

Attachment: IAA comments
International Actuarial Association
The International Actuarial Association (the “IAA”) represents the international actuarial profession. Our sixty-three Full Member actuarial associations represent more than 95% of all actuaries practicing around the world. The Full Member associations of the IAA are listed in an Appendix to this statement. The IAA promotes high standards of actuarial professionalism across the globe and serves as the voice of the actuarial profession when dealing with other international bodies on matters falling within or likely to have an impact on the areas of expertise of actuaries. The IAA appreciates the opportunity to provide comments on this IAIS document.

Due Process
These comments have been prepared by the Insurance Regulation Committee, in cooperation with the Committee on Insurance Accounting, the members of which are listed in an Appendix to this statement. It has also been subject to the due process required for it to constitute a formal view of the IAA, and will be posted to the IAA’s official web site.

IAA Comments and General Remarks

General
The total balance sheet approach which requires that all assets and liabilities of the insured be included and (14.0.4) valued consistently (14.2) forms a reasonable basis for and a sound underlying principle for the evaluation of the financial health of an insurer.

We do feel, however, that some elements of this document supersede the conveyance of principles and instead in prescriptive. For example, the ICP contains elaboration on only one type of economic valuation (14.5.4). Other types of economic valuation are not described.

Paragraph 14.0.5 Chart
Although we understand the intent of this chart, it may not clear to all readers. We believe that the intent is to focus on a comparison between capital resources and required regulatory capital, and that capital resources are the difference between assets and liabilities. One approach might be to have two separate charts: (1) determining capital resources as the difference between assets and liabilities and (2) comparing capital resources and minimum required capital.

Paragraph 14.0.10
Note that in addition to assets potentially having their value reduced in adverse circumstances, the value of the obligation may also increase, e.g., through adverse policyholder behaviour (lapseation of life insurance contracts, increase in disability or workers compensation claims or increase in directors and officers claims). This point should be mentioned here.

Paragraph 14.1
Lack of description of asset valuation. Although this ICP goes into a great deal of detail into the valuation of liabilities of insurance, there is limited description of the valuation of assets, other
than indicating in 14.5.3 that amortized cost should not be used (if this is the intent of 14.5.3). Is this asymmetry of discussion of the valuation of assets and liabilities intentional?

**Paragraph 14.1.2**
Although the choice between the recognition between these two dates (or a combination, e.g., later of bound date and inception date (assuming inception date is the date coverage begins), it does not reach a conclusion. Why is this discussion included here? A major recognition issue involves reinsurance for risk-attaching treaties where the treaty covers future underlying direct insurance. This issue should be addressed here.

**Paragraph 14.1.3**
The parenthetical phrase “(or a part of an insurance contract)” should be placed before “within”, because it is also in the context of technical provisions.

**Paragraph 14.2**
We agree that consistency of asset and liability measurement is very important.

**Paragraph 14.2.3**
In the second line, it is not clear what “value” is referred to – an asset, a liability, capital or income? Depending on what this refers to, 14.2.2 and 14.2.3 may be inconsistent.

**Paragraph 14.2.5**
It is unclear how this paragraph will be used. It indicates that valuations can be different in different jurisdictions – what happens in a multi-national insurer when inconsistent measurement of arises – does this mean it is impossible to obtain a consistent measurement for a group?

**Paragraph 14.3.2**
Reference to “risk management processes” may be better as “internal control processes”? The latter is more typically associated with data to be used for financial reporting purposes.

**Paragraph 14.3.2**
The intent of the last half of this paragraph is unclear. It does not provide any guidance as to whether market-based or entity-specific measurement should be used (or preferred)

**Paragraph 14.3.3**
The second sentence, describing the use of subjectivity, seems to be more appropriate in the section on reliability rather than this section on decision usefulness.

**Paragraph 14.3.4**
Reference is made to a dysfunction or anomalous operation. Note that unreliable market values can exist in thinly traded markets or if a financial instrument is privately placed. We also don’t believe “some” as a modifier to “judgment” adds anything, as it unclear how to assess the different between degrees of judgment.

In the sixth line it may more appropriately be expressed as “a market price may not necessarily provide a reliable basis for a reliable valuation.”
Paragraph 14.3.5
We don’t understand why there is a “, for example,” in the first line. We suggest that the second sentence may be better expressed as “The use of an internal model may enable the insurer to better represent the characteristics of their risks…”

Paragraph 14.3.7
Possibly the second sentence might be better begun as “Insurer should provide transparent information about the approaches they have taken to the valuation…”

Paragraph 14.4.1
The end of this paragraph refers to transparency and comparability. Possibly this might be better expressed in terms of the objectives indicated in 14.3, reliability, decision-usefulness and transparency. Alternatively, 14.3 might also include a section on comparability.

Paragraph 14.5.5
“… is based upon” might be somewhat better than “accords with”.

Paragraph 14.5.8
Fourth from the bottom line. It might be better expressed as “…should provide guidance as to the appropriate values or adjustments insurers…”

Paragraph 14.5.9
Fifth line. “be available regarding” may be more accurate than “exist about”.

Paragraph 14.9.4
The fifth sentence might be clarified to better discuss “insurer specific”. We believe this refers to specific to the insurer's operation other than relative to its portfolio of contracts – otherwise insurer specific assumptions regarding its expenses, mortality selection, … might be included, which does not appear to be its intent.

The principles which risks should be in MOCE and in which risks should be in capital could be better articulated.

Paragraph 14.10.2
Fourth line “to” should be “based on”.

Paragraph 14.11.1
Calculation of the current estimate of embedded options and guarantees may require stochastic simulation and calculation of MOCE over such current estimate may require stochastic on stochastic simulation.

The following sentence should be added after the paragraph: “In the calculation for embedded options and guarantees, simplified methods may be allowed to achieve the practicability.”
Appendix A

Members of the IAA Insurance Regulation Committee

- Toshihiro Kawano
- Lutz Oehlenberg
- James E Rech
- Gorakh Nath Agarwal
- Yuji Anada
- Igotz Aubin
- Gintaras Bakštys
- Maja Benko
- Andrew Chamberlain
- Benoît Courmont
- Angel Crespo Rodrigo
- Kris DeFrain
- Marius Du Toit
- Patrick Healy
- Gyula Horváth
- Thomas Karp
- Philipp Keller
- Esko Kivisaari
- Jolanta Krastina
- Helena Kudlakova
- En-Kuei Liu
- Deana Macek
- Helge-Ivar Magnussen
- Ana Maria Martins Pereira
- Gennaro Olivieri
- Ian Perera
- Frank Rasmussen
- Norma Alicia Rosas Rodríguez
- Richard Roth Jr.
- Kyle Rudden
- David K. Sandberg
- Arne Sandström
- Jacques Tremblay
- H.W.M. Van Broekhoven
- Lucia Chona Ventura
- Eret Võsa
- Igor Zoric

Chairperson
Co-Vice-Chairperson
Co-Vice-Chairperson
Institute of Actuaries of India
Institute of Actuaries of Japan
Institut des Actuaires en Belgique
Lietuvos aktuarijų draugija
Slovensko Aktuarisko Drustvo
Institute and Faculty of Actuaries
Institut des Actuaires
Instituto de Actuarios Españoles
Casualty Actuarial Society
Actuarial Society of South Africa
Society of Actuaries in Ireland
Magyar Aktuárius Társaság
Institute of Actuaries of Australia
Association Suisse des Actuaires
Suomen Aktuaariyhdistys
Latvijas Aktuāru Asociācija
Slovenska Spolocnost Aktuarov
Actuarial Institute of Chinese Taipei
Hrvatsko Aktuarsko Drustvo
Den Norske Aktuarforening
Instituto dos Actuários Portugueses
Istituto Italiano degli Attuari
New Zealand Society of Actuaries
Den Danske Aktuarforening
Colegio Nacional de Actuarios A.C.
Conference of Consulting Actuaries
Caribbean Actuarial Association
American Academy of Actuaries
Svenska Aktuarieföreningen
Canadian Institute of Actuaries
Het Actuarieel Genootschap
Actuarial Society of the Philippines
Eesti Aktuaaride Liit
Udruženje Aktuara Srbije
Members of the IAA Committee on Insurance Accounting

Sam Gutterman
David Congram
Francis Ruygt
Gunn Albertsen
Victor Bagnati
Daniel N. Barron
Guy Castagnoli
Antonella Chiricosta
Alexander Dollhopf
David Finnis
Mark J Freedman
Kavassery S. Gopalakrishnan
Rokas Gyllys
Jozef Hancár
Armand Maurice Ibo
Dragica Jankovic
Burton D Jay
Ad Kok
Christoph Krischanitz
Kurt Lambrechts
Yin Lawn
Kristine Lomanovska
Mike Lombardi
Ana Maria Martins Pereira
Brian Joseph Morrissey
Yoshio Nakamura
Marc F Oberholtzer
Manuel Peraita Huerta
Andreja Radic
Nithiarani Rajasingham
Ravi Clifton Rambarran
Thomas Ringsted
Jaanus Sibul
Henry W Siegel
Dieter Silbernagel
Mateja Slapar
Pentti Soininen
Bjarni Thórdarson
Arseny Timakov
Charles Vincensini
Peter Withey
Derek Wright
Jana Zelinkova
Jesús San Martin

Chairperson
Vice-Chairperson
Vice-Chairperson
Den Norske Aktuarforening
Instituto Brasileiro de Atuária (IBA)
Israel Association of Actuaries
Association Suisse des Actuaires
Istituto Italiano degli Attuari
Svenska Aktuarieföreningen
Institute of Actuaries of Australia
Society of Actuaries
Institute of Actuaries of India
Lietuvos aktuariju draugija
Slovenska Spolocnost Aktuarov
Institut des Actuaires de Côte d'Ivoire
Udru enje Aktuara Srbije
Conference of Consulting Actuaries
Het Actuarieel Genootschap
Aktuarvereinigung Österreichs (AVÖ)
Institut des Actuaires en Belgique
Actuarial Institute of Chinese Taipei
Latvijas Aktuaru Asociacija
Canadian Institute of Actuaries
Instituto dos Actuários Portugueses
Society of Actuaries in Ireland
Institute of Actuaries of Japan
Casualty Actuarial Society
Instituto de Actuarios Españoles
Hrvatsko Aktuarsko Drustvo
Singapore Actuarial Society
Caribbean Actuarial Association
Den Danske Aktuarforening
Eesti Aktuaaride Liit
American Academy of Actuaries
Deutsche Aktuarvereinigung e.V. (DAV)
Slovensko Aktuarsko Drustvo
Suomen Aktuaariyhdistys
Félag Islenska Tryggingsaðferðarins
Russian Guild of Actuaries
Institut des Actuaires
Actuarial Society of South Africa
Institute and Faculty of Actuaries
Ceská Spolecnost Aktuárů
Colegio Nacional de Actuarios A. C.
## Appendix B

**Full Member Associations of the IAA**
- Caribean Actuarial Association
- Consejo Profesional de Ciencias Económicas de la Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires (Argentina)
- Institute of Actuaries of Australia (Australia)
- Aktuarvereinigung Österreichs (AVÖ) (Austria)
- Institut des Actuaires en Belgique (Belgique)
- Instituto Brasileiro de Atuária (IBA) (Brazil)
- Bulgarian Actuarial Society (Bulgaria)
- Canadian Institute of Actuaries (Canada)
- China Association of Actuaries (China)
- Actuarial Institute of Chinese Taipei (Chinese Taipei)
- Institut des Actuaires de Côte d'Ivoire (Côte D’Ivoire)
- Hrvatsko Aktuarsko Drustvo (Croatia)
- Cyprus Association of Actuaries (Cyprus)
- Česká Společnost Aktuárů (Czech Republic)
- Den Danske Aktuarforening (Denmark)
- Egyptian Society of Actuaries (Egypt)
- Eesti Aktuaaride Liit (Estonia)
- Suomen Aktuaariyhdistys (Finland)
- Institut des Actuaires (France)
- Deutsche Aktuarvereinigung e.V. (DAV) (Germany)
- Hellenic Actuarial Society (Greece)
- Actuarial Society of Hong Kong (Hong Kong)
- Magyar Aktuárius Társaság (Hungary)
- Félag Íslenskra Tryggingastærðfræðinga (Iceland)
- Institute of Actuaries of India (India)
- Persatuan Aktuaris Indonesia (Indonesia)
- Society of Actuaries in Ireland (Ireland)
- Israel Association of Actuaries (Israel)
- Istituto Italiano degli Attuari (Italy)
- Institute of Actuaries of Japan (Japan)
- Japanese Society of Certified Pension Actuaries (Japan)
- The Actuarial Society of Kenya (Kenya)
- Latvijas Aktuāru Asociācija (Latvia)
- Lebanese Association of Actuaries (Lebanon)
- Lietuvos Aktuarijų Draugija (Lithuania)
- Persatuan Aktuari Malaysia (Malaysia)
- Colegio Nacional de Actuarios A.C. (Mexico)
- Association Marocaine des Actuaires (Morocco)
- Het Actuarieel Genootschap (Netherlands)
- New Zealand Society of Actuaries (New Zealand)
- Den Norske Aktuarforening (Norway)
- Pakistan Society of Actuaries (Pakistan)
Actuarial Society of the Philippines (Philippines)
Polskie Stowarzyszenie Aktariuszy (Poland)
Instituto dos Actuários Portugueses (Portugal)
Academia de Actuarios de Puerto Rico (Puerto Rico)
Russian Guild of Actuaries (Russia)
Udruženje Aktuara Srbije (Serbia)
Singapore Actuarial Society (Singapore)
Slovenska Spolocnost Aktuarov (Slovakia)
Slovensko Aktuarsko Drustvo (Slovenia)
Actuarial Society of South Africa (South Africa)
Col.legi d'Actuaris de Catalunya (Spain)
Instituto de Actuarios Españoles (Spain)
Svenska Aktuarieföreningen (Sweden)
Association Suisse des Actuaires (Switzerland)
Society of Actuaries of Thailand (Thailand)
Institute and Faculty of Actuaries (United Kingdom)
American Academy of Actuaries (United States)
American Society of Pension Professionals & Actuaries (United States)
Casualty Actuarial Society (United States)
Conference of Consulting Actuaries (United States)
Society of Actuaries (United States)